

The individuals and organisations on this wall have some management responsibility or accountability for past and current conditions at the HIV Care and Treatment Centre of the Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital (BLH). Systematic violation of the human right to basic health care at BLH has led to the death of at least 70 HIV-patients, most of them activists from the HIV/AIDS self-help group PIUMA. All these people have been made aware, repeatedly, of this ongoing abuse of human rights and have

failed to act.

GOVERNMENT

Makete District Council INVOLVED
During the leadership of District Commissioner Omond Kapanga and District Medical Officer Joshua Kapanda, 242 million TZS (approx. 140,000€) of global fund money designated for HIV/AIDS in Makete, including Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital, were embezzled by public officials in Makete District. Although the embezzlements were confirmed by independent audit, the police investigations against the culprits were nowhere.

Makete District Medical Officer
Tanzania has distinct level medical officers who coordinate provision of services including HIV prevention, testing and care. They're supposed to follow guidelines set by the Tanzanian Ministry of Health and the National AIDS Control Programme (NACP), but in Makete District Medical Officers have failed to date to implement adequate services or to make hospital officials accountable for theft, fraud, and abuse of human rights.

Joshua Kapanda INVOLVED
Joshua Kapanda, District Medical Officer in Makete allowed theft, mismanagement and incompetence on a shocking scale to happen at Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital and took no effective steps to stop it. Well aware of the tragic levels of deaths among PIUMA members, he worked to undermine the credibility of PIUMA leaders in the eyes of local people.

Omond Kapanga INVOLVED
Omond Kapanga, District Commissioner for Makete. A District Commissioner is appointed directly by the President in the post and has oversight and accountability for all central government budgets spent on health and social services in the District. Though a powerful and influential figure, he did little to rein in the looting in the church hospital and clinic and actively colluded with church authorities when riot police were called in to break up PIUMA demonstrations against corruption.

Tanzanian Ministry of Health INVOLVED
Tanzanian Ministry of Health (MoH) is responsible for HIV/AIDS policies and programs with enormous financial assistance from donor agencies and governments. Unfortunately, officials from MoH have been exposed by media and other public investigation processes to be involved in corrupt procurement practices, including an outrageous decision to require the use of certain proprietary diagnostic technologies for HIV+ patients that gave bad service at higher prices. These technologies were sold by companies who were shown to have unsavoury, unethical relationships with researchers and decision-makers at MoH. As well as at international bodies including the WHO. MoH is also failed to manage Global Fund money properly in Makete District, leading to it being cut off.

David Homeli Mwakiyusa INVOLVED
David Homeli Mwakiyusa, Minister of Health of Tanzania when many decisions were taken that led directly to the shockingly poor levels of HIV/AIDS care and services in Makete, leading to the deaths of at least 70 HIV patients, most of them members of PIUMA.

Faustine Ndagalla INVOLVED
Faustine Ndagalla, Head of Diagnostic services Department in MoH. In 2004 - 2006, was in charge during the time of several HIV/AIDS technology procurement scandals and allegedly cooperated with individuals in the Essential Health Technology department of WHO to discredit better performing, more affordable equipment. He remains as "a valued member" of the governing council of the IAS, even though the organization has been informed of his involvement in human rights abuses.

Leticiana Maketa Mwangi's INVOLVED
MP Leticiana Maketa Mwangi represents Iringa Region in member of parliament and chairs the Tanzanian Parliamentarians AIDS Coalition (TAPAC) as well as the Coalition of the African Parliamentarians against HIV/AIDS. She reportedly failed to account for 56 million TZS (approx. 30,000€) designated for HIV/AIDS programs in Makete District, which were allegedly never received by the District Council of Makete. In addition, 242 million TZS (approx. 140,000€) of Global Fund money were embezzled by public officials in Makete during her term as commissioner of the Tanzania commission for AIDS (TACAIDS), which had been providing these funds to the local District Council without holding it accountable. Together with the Minister of Health, she was responsible for forcing the use of FACSCOUNT CD4 technology at Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital. The FACSCOUNT machine is reported to be broken most of the time, so that patients receive inadequate care.

Jakaya Kikwete INFORMED
Jakaya Kikwete, President of Tanzania. During his first presidential campaign, Mr Kikwete travelled to Makete District and met directly with representatives of PIUMA including Veneranda Songu. He pledged support for their efforts and promised a vigorous fight against HIV in the District which has one of the highest prevalences of the disease in Tanzania. But corruption and incompetence in the health care system in Bulongwa and the more remote parts of Makete District have gone largely unchallenged by the President and by his local managers, the District Commissioners.

CHURCH

South Central Diocese (SCD) INVOLVED
The South Central Diocese (SCD) of the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania (ELCT) is the owner and manager of the Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital. It has a documented history of lack of accountability and misuse of money from northern and Tanzanian church donors and fraudulent management practices with respect to public health care budgets.

Bishop Shadrack Manywa INVOLVED
Bishop of the ELCT South Central Diocese when the PIUMA-affiliated clinic was closed by force and sub-standard, HIV-related care began in 2006. In 2003-2004 nearly 300,000€ were "looted" from Lutheran-supported humanitarian and development projects in his diocese. Stolen money has never been recovered. Manywa left his post in 2007 and is still employed by the church.

Bishop Hans Mwakabana INVOLVED
Bishop Hans Mwakabana, current Lutheran bishop of the South Central Diocese, has acknowledged publicly that the service quality at the hospital went down but has never acted on demands by the community and PIUMA to hold the culprits responsible or to recover the stolen money. Former hospital staff he holds responsible are still on the payroll of the church.

The Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania INVOLVED
The Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania (ELCT) runs a network of private hospitals and health clinics that includes the Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital. These health services are heavily subsidized by European and American Lutheran churches and are recognized and funded by the Government of Tanzania as the primary health care providers in a number of regions including the Bulongwa area. Quality of care is supposed to be monitored and managed across the network by a centralized ELCT health authority. ELCT does not subject its dioceses and institutions to independent audits. Audits are only conducted by an internal audit division of ELCT and then only sporadically.

Bishop Alexander Malauwa INVOLVED
Presiding Bishop of the ELCT ignored direct appeals for justice from PIUMA and took no steps to recover stolen money in the South Central Diocese or to improve HIV services that were "seriously affected" by the clinic's shut down and its aftermath. Public denunciations of corruption in Tanzania but does nothing to end it in his own church hierarchy.

Lutheran Mission Cooperation (LMC) INVOLVED
Lutheran Mission Cooperation (LMC) based in Tanzania is the coordinating body for the ELCT and its northern donors. The funding of Lutheran church operations in Tanzania dates from German colonial times. Ongoing financial support comes from Germany, Scandinavia and American Lutheran Churches with particularly large contributions from the Northstar Centre for World Mission (NMZ) in Hamburg and Mission One World from Bavaria (MOW).

Reverend Manfred Schreckenbach INVOLVED
Rev. Manfred Schreckenbach, Tanzania Desk Officer of the Bavarian mission organization MEW and former long-serving vice-chairman of Lutheran Mission Cooperation activity in Tanzania. As highest ranking European LMC Board member, he was accountable for the transfer of millions of Euros in support of small independent activities in the entire Tanzania Lutheran church and identified fraudulent accounting practices in a number of Tanzanian church-based operations and development programs.

Former LMC Secretary Lars Holgreen, Lutheran Church of Sweden
The LMC under Holgreen issued a report in October 2006 showing that approximately 75% of the projects of the ELCT can not confirm the rightful use of their financial resources. Refused to comment publicly to take action on the HIV clinic closure, heavy-handed intimidation tactics that followed, or theft of health care money in Bulongwa.

Klaus Schäfer & Volker Schaun INVOLVED
Northstar Mission Centre (NMZ) in Hamburg, Germany, is one of the largest financial backers of the Diocese where Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital is situated. Klaus Schäfer NMZ chair and Rev. Volker Schaun, NMZ Africa Desk Officer of NMZ, admitted that an NMZ-sponsored equiptment measure in Tanzania called the SCD Clinic for years but refused to take corrective action on behalf of HIV patients who were dying from inadequate care at the Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital.

Bishop Johannes Friedrich INFORMED
Through its mission "Mission One World" the Bavarian Church funds the ELCT to a large extent and invests church taxes and donations into the ELCT without demanding independent and published audits. Though the leadership under the presiding bishop of the Bavarian church Johannes Friedrich is well informed about the corruption scandal and the human rights abuses against People Living with HIV/AIDS in the SCD, his church did nothing to save the lives of PIUMA in Makete or to take legal actions against the culprits.

Austrian Lutheran Church
The Austrian Lutheran Church provided through their mission EAWM financial support to establish the HIV Care and Treatment Centre at the Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital through their mission wing EAWM. The program had been responsible for documented, high-quality services before the clinic was closed by force in 2006. EAWM became embroiled in a battle with other European Lutheran missions and churches when it refused to play along with corrupt practices in Tanzania.

Bishop Michael Bönker & Bishop Herwig Sturm INFORMED
The leadership of the Austrian Lutheran church, particularly the former bishop Herwig Sturm and the presiding Bishop Dr. Michael Bönker have refused to become involved in correcting human rights abuses at Bulongwa Lutheran Church when alerted directly and repeatedly about the worsening situation of HIV patients who depend on the local Lutheran church for care.

Lutheran World Federation INFORMED
Lutheran World Federation (LWF) is "a global communion of Christian Churches in the Lutheran tradition". The ELCT and the supporting donor churches are all members of the LWF.

Reverend Mark Hanson INFORMED
Rev. Mark Hanson, President of the Lutheran World Federation has taken a strong public stand to engage in "public acts of repentance" for the church's mistreatment of people living with HIV/AIDS but his organization took no steps to correct the situation of PIUMA members' mistreatment by Lutheran church institutions in Makete when alerted to the human rights abuse and death.

Ecumenical Advocacy Alliance INFORMED
Ecumenical Advocacy Alliance (EAA) has refused even to reply to received information about the involvement of some of its Lutheran member organizations in the corruption scandal and human rights abuses at Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital. In spite of its PR campaign claiming "solidarity with HIV people, the truth is that it will not call its own member organisations to account when they abuse the right of PIUMA to life and treatment.

OTHERS

Family Health International
Family Health International (FHI) is a large American NGO that has implemented responsibility for HIV/AIDS programs supported by PEPFAR and other foreign donors for the Iringa Region where PIUMA members live.

Dr. Eric van Praag INFORMED
Dr. Eric van Praag - Country Director of FHI Tanzania - responsible for the ART roll out in Iringa region. Admitted "challenges and setbacks" in implementation but has taken no effective steps to insist on minimally acceptable standards of care for HIV+ patients at the Care and Treatment Centre at Bulongwa Lutheran Hospital. And in spite of direct appeals for his involvement to enhance quality of care and reduce mortality for PIUMA members and other PLWHAs in Bulongwa, did nothing to protect the basic human right to decent, basic care for these PLWHAs.

Global Fund INVOLVED
Global Fund to fight AIDS, Malaria and Tuberculosis is Tanzania's main source of funds for programmes to combat AIDS, tuberculosis and malaria. The Fund repeatedly failed to ensure that aid designated for HIV patients reached the target groups. In 2008 it was announced that 242 million TZS (approx. 140,000€) of Global Fund money had been embezzled by public officials in Makete District. In 2009, The Guardian newspaper reported that drugs worth 819,000 \$ financed by the Global Fund went missing in Tanzania. According to media reports, Tanzania is "worrying the Global Fund" (The Guardian Feb 16th 2010) and it is alleged that "auditors found it difficult to verify and establish the audit trail for the progress reports and disbursement requests."

IAS INFORMED
Robin Gorria, former Executive Director of IAS has up to now refused to investigate members of decision-making bodies of the IAS who are directly responsible for the gross violation of the human right to basic health care through corrupt procurement and management practices in their home country. The irony and hypocrisy of the IAS leading a human rights abuse in its own structures while making respect for human rights its central theme in Vienna in 2010 is breathtaking.

WHO - EDT INVOLVED
Dr. Gabry Vercauteren, an Essential Health Technology expert of WHO, was accused by a probe team of the Tanzanian MoH to have played a major role in a questionable procurement decision concerning CD4 Cell Enumeration Technologies leading to the monopoly of Becton Dickinson on the distribution of CD4 count technology in Tanzania. According to the investigation report, Dr. Vercauteren refused to cooperate with another manufacturer of more affordable and effective CD4-counters and allegedly discredited the manufacturer in spite of knowledge that numerous independent studies proved the opposite. Dr. Vercauteren did not respect to the Tanzanian probe team that attempted to cast some light on this dark business.

Becton Dickinson/ Biorace Health Products Limited INVOLVED
According to Tanzanian news reports, Becton Dickinson (BD) and its local supplier Biorace Health Products Limited (BHPL) maintain a monopoly on the distribution of BD FACSCount in Tanzania. Despite higher costs per test and several disadvantages relevant to developing countries, for example FACSCounts inability to determine the immune state of small children, the MoH still opted to continue purchasing the FACSCount instead of more cost effective CD4 cell enumeration technologies. Local journalists therefore publicly called upon the Fair Competition Commission and Combating of Corruption Bureau to probe BD's monopoly in Tanzania.

